



Setti D. Warren
Mayor

City of Newton, Massachusetts
Department of Planning and Development
1000 Commonwealth Avenue Newton, Massachusetts 02459

Telephone
(617) 796-1120
Telefax
(617) 796-1142
TDD/TTY
(617) 796-1089
www.newtonma.gov

Candace Havens
Director

**MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING AND PUBLIC HEARINGS
NEWTON HISTORICAL COMMISSION**

DATE: April 25, 2013

PLACE/TIME: City Hall, Room 202
7:00 p.m.

ATTENDING: Donald Lang, Chair
William Roesner, Member
Donald Tellalian, Alternate
See Attendance List

Nancy Grissom, Member
Rodney Barker, Member
Brian Lever, Staff

ABSENT: David Morton, Member
Alfred Wojciechowski, Member
Leonard Sherman, Alternate

The meeting was called to order at 7:15 p.m. with Donald Lang presiding as Chair. Voting permanent members were Lang, Grissom, Roesner, and Barker. Alternate member Tellalian also voted. Barker left the meeting at 9:30 p.m. Brian Lever acted as recording secretary and the meeting was digitally recorded.

286 Waverley Avenue – Landmark / Preservation Restriction Review

Architect Scott Aquilina presented an application to approve the installation of a fiberglass door (already installed) on the new addition. The Commission reviewed plans and photographs of the property. Staff stated that a wood panel door was approved at this location, but during the course of construction a different door was chosen to match others on the new addition. Aquilina stated that the door has transparency through the glass allowing staff to see and greet visitors and that this was beneficial to the operation of the museum. Grissom motioned to approve the door as installed with Tellalian seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on April 25, 2013 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0,

RESOLVED to approve the installation of an exterior door at 286 Waverley Avenue as installed on the north façade of the new addition.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Donald Lang, Chair	Nancy Grissom, Member
William Roesner, Member	Rodney Barker, Member

1697 Beacon Street (Angier School) – Working Session

Oudia Young and Alex Valcarce from the City of Newton, architects Ken and Donna DiNisco, as well as Angier School Principal Loreta Lamberti presented information regarding the proposed demolition of the school, options for potential mitigation, and solicited comments from the Commission. Staff stated that the demolition delay on this building expired in February 2013 and that the project was presently under the review of the Massachusetts Historical Commission (MHC). Staff further stated that the MHC requested the comments of the Newton Historical Commission as part of its review. Young and Ken DiNisco discussed the review process involved in including studying alternatives such as the renovation of the building, constructing additions, and selecting alternative sites. Young and Ken DiNisco stated that alternatives had been fully explored and that demolition of the existing school building and construction of a new school at the same location was the preferred option. Ken DiNisco discussed the possibility of salvaging and reusing architectural features in the new school. Lamberti stated that teachers and parents had also been involved in documenting the history of the Angier School and envisioning an exhibit on the history of the property in the new building. Barker and Roesner expressed concern that the reuse of the building had not been fully explored. Lang inquired about the building's construction and Valcarce stated that it was a combination of steel and masonry that would be difficult to renovate and comply with current energy, accessibility, and education standards. Lang stated that he hoped if a new school is constructed that it will complement the neighborhood and have a distinctive architectural character as the existing one does. Lang motioned to provide comments to the Massachusetts Historical Commission with Grissom seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on April 25, 2013 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0,

RESOLVED to send a letter to the Massachusetts Historical Commission expressing the Newton Historical Commission's preference for reusing the existing school, but should that prove unfeasible that the Commission supports the proposed exhibit on the history of Angier in the new school, updating historical documentation on the property, and reusing existing architectural elements as mitigation for the loss of the building as well as that the Commission recommends a new school be sensitively designed to fit within the neighborhood context.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Donald Lang, Chair

William Roesner, Member

Donald Tellalian, Alternate

Nancy Grissom, Member

Rodney Barker, Member

1832 Washington Street / 39 Stanton Avenue – Demolition Review

Stephen Vona presented an application to amend a previous approval for a waiver of the demolition delay at this property. The Commission reviewed plans and photographs of the property. Staff stated that the Commission had previously issued a waiver of the demolition delay at this property for additions to the rear of the building and that as the property has frontage on both Washington Street and Stanton Avenue the applicant wished to mirror the proposal with additions on the front facing Washington Street and create a new front façade on what is presently the rear, facing Stanton Avenue. Vona stated that the design of the existing building was the same on both facades with the exception of the door placement. Vona further stated that due to traffic along Washington Street as well as the narrow street frontage, that the property was best viewed from Stanton Avenue. Roesner suggested adding windows in place of the door on the front façade of the attached garage. Roesner further suggested varying the window design on the two rear ells. Grissom motioned to approve an amended waiver of the demolition delay with Roesner seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on April 25, 2013 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0,

RESOLVED to approve an amended waiver of the demolition delay at 1832 Washington Street / 39 Stanton Avenue as presented with the following conditions: (1) that the proposed barn door be removed from the proposed attached garage and replaced with two six-light simulated divided lite windows; (2) that the window patterning on the proposed rear additions be varied so that they do not match; and (3) that revised plans be submitted and approved be staff.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Donald Lang, Chair	Nancy Grissom, Member
William Roesner, Member	Rodney Barker, Member
Donald Tellalian, Alternate	

31 Kappius Path – Demolition Review

Property owner Jennifer Gorham presented an application to demolish the residence. The Commission reviewed the application and photographs of the property and neighborhood as well as a letter in support of the preservation of the building from Ronald Andersen (38 Kappius Path). Staff stated that this 1948 Ranch style residence is located within Oak Hill Park on the path system. The building retains its original form, but the building now has vinyl siding and the windows have been replaced. The building's first occupants were Jack and Alyce Batten. Jack worked in the real estate business. Buildings in the vicinity are a mix of original Oak Hill Park residences, altered Oak Hill Park residences, and new construction. Gorham presented photographs of the area and discussed the changes that had occurred in the area with new construction and alterations to original Oak Hill Park residences. Marc Sirote (95 Spiers Road) spoke in support of the demolition of the building and noted that the character of the neighborhood had changed. Gene Charny and Lisa Thorn (38 Kappius Path) spoke in favor of the building's preservation as part of the area's history as a World War II veterans housing project and stated that the building retained integrity. Mary Foxon (40 Van Wart Path) and Marty Flax (16 Van Wart Path) also spoke in favor of the building's preservation. Lang acknowledged that changes had occurred in the area, but stated that the context around this building was not as altered as other areas of Oak Hill Park. Roesner stated that in the past the Commission was especially concerned about those buildings located along the past system. Roesner motioned to find the building preferably preserved with Tellalian seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on April 25, 2013 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 3-1,

RESOLVED to find the residence at 31 Kappius Path Preferably Preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Donald Lang, Chair
William Roesner, Member
Donald Tellalian, Alternate

Voting in the Negative:

Nancy Grissom, Member

Not Present:

Rodney Barker, Member

76 Carlton Road – Demolition Review

Property owner John Boyle presented an application to demolish the residence. The Commission reviewed the application and photographs of the property. Staff stated that this 1927 Spanish-Eclectic style residence is located in a Waban neighborhood that is predominantly Colonial Revival style of different variants including Garrison, Spanish, and Colonial Revival and Craftsman mixtures. Other architectural styles in the area include Cape and Tudor. This building was designed by H. E. Kellogg a Boston based architect and owned by Dr. Herman and Ella Bumpus. Herman was an instructor in Providence. Buildings of this architectural style are rare in Newton. In most cases these buildings are two stories and variants of Colonial Revival style. This building has unusual ornate features including a miniature bell tower, rafter

tails, balconet, a tile roof, and terra cotta block construction with a stucco siding. In scale and massing, this building is also unusual in the neighborhood; however in time period this building is consistent with the area and has details seen on other larger residences. Lori Silver (84 Carlton Road), Errol Yudelman (70 Carlton Road), and Charles Klee (5 Kelveden Road) spoke in favor of the building's preservation. Commission members spoke in favor of the building's preservation and that it was an unusual architectural example in the City. Roesner motioned to find the building preferably preserved with Tellalian seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on April 25, 2013 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-0,

RESOLVED to find the residence at 76 Carlton Road Preferably Preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Donald Lang, Chair

Nancy Grissom, Member

William Roesner, Member

Donald Tellalian, Alternate

Not Present:

Rodney Barker, Member

1118 Commonwealth Avenue – Demolition Review

Teresa DeMaina presented an application to demolish the building. The Commission reviewed the application and photographs of the property. Staff stated that his circa 1870 residence is located in an area of Newton known as Cold Spring City. This neighborhood off of Commonwealth Avenue was largely occupied by Irish immigrants during the late 19th century. Most of the buildings in this neighborhood are vernacular cottage residences rather than distinct architectural examples. This building was owned by Mary Gahan and her family during the late 19th and early 20th century. The building has had a new front portico added as well as asbestos siding, but otherwise maintains its form and massing. The Historical Commission reviewed the demolition of this building in 1999 and found it historically significant, but not preferably preserved. Commission members expressed support for upholding the previous determination. Grissom motioned to find the building not preferably preserved with Tellalian seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on April 25, 2013 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-0,

RESOLVED to find the residence at 1118 Commonwealth Avenue Not Preferably Preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Donald Lang, Chair

Nancy Grissom, Member

William Roesner, Member

Donald Tellalian, Alternate

Not Present:

Rodney Barker, Member

1611 Centre Street – Demolition Review

Jim Chiasson presented an application to demolish the residence. Staff stated that this 1927 Dutch Colonial residence is located in an area of Newton Highlands with a mixed architectural context. The first occupants were Albert and Alice Rust. Albert was president of a wholesale wool company in Boston. The building has been altered with an addition to the rear and over the existing sun porch. The building largely retains its form and massing as well as its clapboard siding and windows. The surrounding area consists of three other Dutch Colonials including one adjacent to this property, some late 19th century Victorian era buildings, multi-family residences, as well as the commercial area, at the intersection of Walnut and Centre Streets and a small condominium complex north on Centre Street. The building is a typical example of Dutch-Colonial style common throughout Newton. Lang noted that the context around this building has a mix of styles and sizes but supported the preservation of the building. Roesner stated that he felt the

building was a good architectural example and well situated in the surrounding context. Grissom stated that she felt the building had well preserved details. Roesner motioned to find the building preferably preserved with Grissom seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on April 25, 2013 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-0,

RESOLVED to find the residence at 1611 Centre Street Preferably Preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Donald Lang, Chair

Nancy Grissom, Member

William Roesner, Member

Donald Tellalian, Alternate

Not Present:

Rodney Barker, Member

53 McCarthy Road – Demolition Review

Chris Utano presented an application to demolish the residence. Staff stated that this 1948 Ranch style residence is located in Oak Hill Park, but not on the path system. The building has a one-story rear addition as well as vinyl siding and replacement windows, but is otherwise an intact example of one of the original residences. The building's first occupants were Edward and Alison Slade. Edward worked as an auto mechanic. The surrounding neighborhood context along McCarthy Road has changed substantially with the construction of larger new residences including one adjacent to this property as well as in the immediate vicinity. Utano stated that the neighborhood surrounding the building has changed dramatically. Roesner expressed support for the building's preservation. Other Commission members noted the changes that have occurred to the building and surrounding area. Grissom motioned to find the building not preferably preserved, with Tellalian seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on April 25, 2013 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 3-1,

RESOLVED to find the residence at 53 McCarthy Road Not Preferably Preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Donald Lang, Chair

Nancy Grissom, Member

Donald Tellalian, Alternate

Voting in the Negative:

William Roesner, Member

Not Present:

Rodney Barker, Member

38 Beechcroft Road – Demolition Review

Architect Sally Degan and property owners Tracy and Larry Richmond presented an application to demolish the detached garage on the property and construct an attached garage addition. Staff stated that this property consists of two buildings, a 1912 Colonial Revival style residence and a detached 1917 garage. The applicant is proposing to demolish the garage and construct a new attached garage addition to the residence. This property is located within the Farlow Hill National Register Historic District and buildings reviewed under the Demolition Delay ordinance are subject to a potential 18-month delay. The garage was built after the house, but does have similar characteristics such as a stucco siding and a hip roof. The most ornate features of the garage are the doors and windows with lozenge muntin patterns. The garage is listed as a contributing feature to the district and detached garages and carriage houses are a noted feature of this neighborhood. A similar project occurred at 37 Beechcroft Road where the Commission permitted through a waiver of the demolition delay, the demolition of a detached garage, which was replaced by a sensitively designed attached garage addition. Degan presented six letters of support for the proposed project. Tellalian asked if the existing garage could be reused and Tracy Richmond stated that it was undersized for their vehicles. Lang stated that additions that are to the rear of the building are

preferable as that limits their visibility. Lang and Roesner suggested reducing the amount of pavement or using another driveway material. Degan stated that the driveway entrance could be narrowed. Lang stated that he felt the existing garage did not merit preservation. Degan stated that the addition could be shifted further back away from the street. Grissom motioned to find the garage not preferably preserved with Tellalian seconding, this motion passed. Grissom motioned to find the residence preferably preserved with Tellalian seconding, this motion passed. Grissom motioned to waive the demolition delay on the residence with Tellalian seconding, this motion passed.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on April 25, 2013 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 3-1,

RESOLVED to find the garage at 38 Beechcroft Road Not Preferably Preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Donald Lang, Chair

Nancy Grissom, Member

Donald Tellalian, Alternate

Voting in the Negative:

William Roesner, Member

Not Present:

Rodney Barker, Member

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on April 25, 2013 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-0,

RESOLVED to find the residence at 38 Beechcroft Road Preferably Preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Donald Lang, Chair

William Roesner, Member

Nancy Grissom, Member

Donald Tellalian, Alternate

Not Present:

Rodney Barker, Member

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on April 25, 2013 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-0,

RESOLVED to waive the demolition delay at 38 Beechcroft Road with the following conditions: (1) that the proposed garage addition be recessed four feet from the existing front (west) façade of the north addition, (2) that the driveway entrance at the street be narrowed to 16-feet wide, and (3) that revised plans with materials information be submitted and approved by staff prior to issuance of a building permit.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Donald Lang, Chair

William Roesner, Member

Nancy Grissom, Member

Donald Tellalian, Alternate

Not Present:

Rodney Barker, Member

34 Wilde Road – Demolition Review

Architect Mike McKay presented an application to waive the demolition delay at this property based upon a plan for a replacement building. Staff stated that this 1911 Craftsman style residence is located in a neighborhood developed during the 1910's through the 1930s. The Commission previously reviewed the demolition of the adjacent property 24 Wilde Road (a circa 1930 Colonial Revival) and found that building preferably preserved. There has thus far been no demolition or new construction in the immediate area and the neighborhood retains the early 20th century architectural character. McKay described the building with Shingle style elements including a projecting shingle detail at the gable end, clapboard and shingle siding, and stone foundation. Grissom suggested that the ganged windows on the second floor be

eliminated and Roesner suggested eliminating the shed roof from the right-side elevation. Grissom motioned to issue a waiver of the demolition delay with Tellalian seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on April 25, 2013 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-0,

RESOLVED to waive the demolition delay at 34 Wilde Road with the following conditions: (1) that the ganged windows proposed on the second floor be separated, (2) that the shed roof proposed on the right-side elevation be eliminated, and (3) that revised plans with materials information be submitted and approved by staff prior to issuance of a building permit.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Donald Lang, Chair

William Roesner, Member

Nancy Grissom, Member

Donald Tellalian, Alternate

Not Present:

Rodney Barker, Member

Administrative Discussion

Minutes:

The Commission approved the minutes from March 2013 unanimously.

Design Guidelines:

The Commission voted unanimously to adopt the City of Newton Historic Preservation Design Guidelines as the design guidelines for the Commission's review of projects.

Meeting adjourned 11:05 PM